

1 HONORABLE THOMAS O. RICE  
2  
3  
4  
5  
6  
7  
8  
9

J. CHRISTOPHER LYNCH, WSBA #17462  
JEFFREY R. SMITH, WSBA #37460  
RHETT V. BARNEY, WSBA #44764  
LEE & HAYES, PLLC  
601 W. Riverside Avenue, Suite 1400  
Spokane, WA 99201  
Phone: (509) 324-9256  
Fax: (509) 323-8979  
Emails: [chris@leehayes.com](mailto:chris@leehayes.com)  
[jeffreys@leehayes.com](mailto:jeffreys@leehayes.com)  
[rhettb@leehayes.com](mailto:rhettb@leehayes.com)

10 *Counsel for Defendant Ryan Lamberson*

11  
12 **UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT**  
13 **EASTERN DISTRICT OF WASHINGTON**

14 ELF-MAN, LLC,

15 Plaintiff,

16 vs.

17 RYAN LAMBERSON,

18 Defendant.

19 No. 2:13-CV-0395-TOR

20 DEFENDANT LAMBERSON'S  
21 MOTION TO DISMISS PLAINTIFF'S  
22 FIRST AMENDED COMPLAINT, OR  
23 FOR LEAVE TO FILE SECOND  
24 AMENDED ANSWER, AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES, AND  
25 COUNTERCLAIM

26 March 12, 2014  
Without Oral Argument

Defendant Ryan Lamberson, through his counsel Lee & Hayes PLLC, hereby  
moves this Court for Orders as to the following:

DEFENDANT LAMBERSON'S MOTION  
TO DISMISS PLAINTIFF'S FIRST AMENDED  
COMPLAINT, OR FOR LEAVE TO FILE SECOND  
AMENDED ANSWER, AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES,  
AND COUNTERCLAIM- 1

LEE & HAYES, PLLC  
601 West Riverside Avenue, Suite 1400  
Spokane, Washington 99201  
Telephone: (509)324-9256 Fax: (509)323-8979

1  
2 1. Defendant Moves to withdraw its First Amended Answer, Affirmative Defenses  
3 and Counterclaim (ECF #18) filed January 3, 2104, without prejudice and pursuant  
4 to Fed. R. Civ. P. 41(a)(2), (c), and

5  
6 2. Defendant Moves to Dismiss Plaintiff's First Amended Complaint (ECF #3)  
7 pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(6).  
8

9 3. Defendant Moves in the alternative for Leave to File a Second Amended  
10 Answer, Affirmative Defenses and Counterclaim, pursuant to Fed. R. Civ. P.  
11 15(a)(2), (d).  
12

13 A. The Interests of Justice Should Allow Defendant to Withdraw its First  
14 Amended Answer, Affirmative Defenses and Counterclaim without Prejudice.  
15

16 Defendant moves to withdraw its First Amended Answer, Affirmative  
17 Defenses and Counterclaim, so as to allow it to move for dismissal of the First  
18 Amended Complaint under Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(6) on the basis of the Order  
19 Granting Motion to Dismiss as to that identical First Amended Complaint as entered  
20 by Judge Lasnik in Elf-Man, LLV v. Cariveau et al, Case No. 2:13-cv-00507-RSL  
21 in the Western District of Washington on January 17, 2014. (ECF #78 in that  
22 matter). In the Alternative, Defendant requests leave to file a Second Amended  
23 Answer, Affirmative Defenses and Counterclaim.  
24  
25 DEFENDANT LAMBERSON'S MOTION  
26 TO DISMISS PLAINTIFF'S FIRST AMENDED  
COMPLAINT, OR FOR LEAVE TO FILE SECOND  
AMENDED ANSWER, AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES,  
AND COUNTERCLAIM- 2

1       This lawsuit against Mr. Lamberson was severed from the companion case  
2 (Elf-Man LLC v. Brown et al, case No. 2:13-cv-00115-TOR) on November 21,  
3 2013 and the new Case No. 2:13-cv-00395-TOR was created. On November 22,  
4 2013, a Notice Setting Court's Scheduling Conference (ECF #13) issued, triggering  
5 the requirements of Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(a), (f), even though Defendant had yet to  
6 Answer or responsively plead to the First Amended Complaint. Consequently,  
7 Defendant hurried to file its Answer, Affirmative Defenses and Counterclaim on  
8 December 17, 2013 (ECF #15) before in the Scheduling Conference and filed a First  
9 Amended Answer, Affirmative Defenses and Counterclaim on January 3, 2014  
10 (ECF #18). Plaintiff filed a Motion to Dismiss Defendant's Amended Answer,  
11 Affirmative Defenses and Counterclaim on Friday January 17, 2014 (ECF #20), at  
12 the same time that Judge Lasnik entered his order dismissing the identical First  
13 Amended Complaint in the Western District.

14       Defendant Lamberson has moved to voluntarily dismiss its First Amended  
15 Answer, Affirmative Defenses and Counterclaim without prejudice and under Fed.  
16 R. Civ. P. 41(a)(2) and (c). The First Amended Answer was filed less than 21 days  
17 ago. Allowing this dismissal without prejudice is in the interests of justice. If this  
18 court is inclined to follow Judge Lasnik's ruling as to the identical First Amended  
19 Complaint, Mr. Lamberson can file a new Answer, Affirmative Defenses and  
20 DEFENDANT LAMBERSON'S MOTION  
21 TO DISMISS PLAINTIFF'S FIRST AMENDED  
22 COMPLAINT, OR FOR LEAVE TO FILE SECOND  
23 AMENDED ANSWER, AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES,  
24 AND COUNTERCLAIM- 3

1 Counterclaim as to any Second Amended Complaint that may result from such a  
2 ruling. If this court is inclined to grant the pending Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(6) Motion  
3 with prejudice and without leave to amend, then defendant is satisfied with  
4 withdrawal of its counterclaims and can proceed toward awardable costs of the  
5 action.

7

8       B. The Interests of Justice Should Allow Defendant Lamberson to Join the  
9 pending Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(6) Motion.

10       A Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(6) Motion to Dismiss is pending as to the First  
11 Amended Complaint in the companion case (Case No. 2:13-cv-00115-TOR, ECF  
12 #76.) The First Amended Complaint is identical to that which was also the subject  
13 of a pending Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(6) Motion (ECF #60) in the Western District of  
14 Washington, Case No. 2:13-cv-00507-RSL. Judge Lasnik granted that Motion last  
15 Friday January 17, 2014 (ECF #78), and this court is set to rule on an identical  
16 Motion (by the same counsel, on the same briefing, as to the identical First  
17 Amended Complaint.)

21       Defendant Lamberson joins in the pending Motion to Dismiss and asks the  
22 Court to grant it with prejudice or as ordered by Judge Lasnik.

24

25

26 DEFENDANT LAMBERSON'S MOTION  
TO DISMISS PLAINTIFF'S FIRST AMENDED  
COMPLAINT, OR FOR LEAVE TO FILE SECOND  
AMENDED ANSWER, AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES,  
AND COUNTERCLAIM- 4

LEE & HAYES, PLLC  
601 West Riverside Avenue, Suite 1400  
Spokane, Washington 99201  
Telephone: (509)324-9256 Fax: (509)323-8979

1       C.    The Interests of Justice Should Allow Defendant Lamberson to File a  
 2   Second Amended Answer, Affirmative Defenses and Counterclaim.

3  
 4       If the Court does not allow Defendant Lamberson to withdraw and dismiss its  
 5   First Amended Answer, Affirmative Defenses and Counterclaim so as to allow it to  
 6   join the pending Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(6) Motion, then Mr. Lamberson requests  
 7   leave to file its Second Amended Answer, Affirmative Defenses and Counterclaim.  
 8  
 9       The form of that proposed Second Amended Answer, Affirmative Defenses and  
 10   Counterclaim is attached as Exhibit 1.

11  
 12       Mr. Lamberson has recently amicably terminated his account with Comcast,  
 13   his Internet Service Provider. Mr. Lamberson's counsel was so informed over the  
 14   telephone in a call with Mr. Lamberson on January 8, 2014 . (Exhibit 2, Declaration  
 15   of J. Christopher Lynch at paragraph 2.) Consequently, his damages and potential  
 16   for continuing damages caused by the plaintiff's defamation and tortious  
 17   interference with Mr. Lamberson's relationship with Comcast have ended, and  
 18  
 19       Defendant proposes to drop its Counterclaims 4 and 6.

20  
 21       Plaintiff filed a Motion to Dismiss (ECF #20) on Friday January 17, 2014; but  
 22   defendant's proposed Second Amended Answer, Affirmative Defenses and  
 23  
 24   Counterclaim directly addresses the majority of the points raised in that Motion by

25  
 26       DEFENDANT LAMBERSON'S MOTION  
 TO DISMISS PLAINTIFF'S FIRST AMENDED  
 COMPLAINT, OR FOR LEAVE TO FILE SECOND  
 AMENDED ANSWER, AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES,  
 AND COUNTERCLAIM- 5

LEE & HAYES, PLLC  
 601 West Riverside Avenue, Suite 1400  
 Spokane, Washington 99201  
 Telephone: (509)324-9256 Fax: (509)323-8979

1 making amendments as to the allegedly improper form. (Exhibit 2, Lynch Dec. at  
2 paragraph 3.)  
3

4 Defendant will timely file its Opposition to Plaintiff's Motion, but offers this  
5 Second Amended Answer, Affirmative Defenses and Counterclaim in the interests  
6 of judicial economy and to streamline the proceedings by eliminating issues. This  
7 offer is made in the alternative to defendant's motion to withdraw its responsive  
8 pleading and to proceed to join the Fed. R. Civ. P. 12(b)(6) Motion pending in the  
9 companion case.  
10

11 Motions to Amend under Fed. R. Civ. P. 15 should be granted with good  
12 cause shown and in the early stages of the proceedings as is the case here.  
13

14       D. Conclusion  
15

16       Consequently, Defendant Lamberson requests an Order (i) allowing  
17 withdrawal without prejudice of Defendant's Answer, Affirmative Defenses and  
18 Counterclaim and First Amended Answer, Affirmative Defenses and Counterclaim,  
19 (ii) dismissing the First Amended Complaint, or in the alternative (iii) to allow  
20 Defendant to file its proposed Second Amended Answer, Affirmative Defenses and  
21 Counterclaim.  
22  
23  
24  
25

26 DEFENDANT LAMBERSON'S MOTION  
TO DISMISS PLAINTIFF'S FIRST AMENDED  
COMPLAINT, OR FOR LEAVE TO FILE SECOND  
AMENDED ANSWER, AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES,  
AND COUNTERCLAIM- 6

LEE & HAYES, PLLC  
601 West Riverside Avenue, Suite 1400  
Spokane, Washington 99201  
Telephone: (509)324-9256 Fax: (509)323-8979

DATED this 20<sup>th</sup> day of January, 2014.

## LEE & HAYES, PLLC

By: *s/ J. Christopher Lynch*

J. Christopher Lynch, WSBA #17462

Jeffrey R. Smith, WSBA #37460

Rhett V. Barney, WSBA #44764

601 W. Riverside Avenue, Suite 1400

Spokane, WA 99201

Phone: (509) 324-9256

Fax: (509) 323-8979

Emails: [chris@leehayes.com](mailto:chris@leehayes.com)

jeffreys@leehayes.com

[rhettb@leehayes.com](mailto:rhettb@leehayes.com)

*Counsel for Defendant Ryan Lamberson*

DEFENDANT LAMBERSON'S MOTION  
TO DISMISS PLAINTIFF'S FIRST AMENDED  
COMPLAINT, OR FOR LEAVE TO FILE SECOND  
AMENDED ANSWER, AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES,  
AND COUNTERCLAIM- 7

LEE & HAYES, PLLC  
601 West Riverside Avenue, Suite 1400  
Spokane, Washington 99201  
Telephone: (509)324-9256 Fax: (509)323-8979

## **CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

I hereby certify that on the 20<sup>th</sup> day of January, 2014, I caused to be electronically filed the foregoing with the Clerk of the Court using the CM/ECF system which will send notification of such filing to the following:

Maureen C. VanderMay

[efile@vandermaylawfirm.com](mailto:efile@vandermaylawfirm.com)

LEE & HAYES, PLLC

By: *s/ J. Christopher Lynch*

J. Christopher Lynch, WSBA #17462  
601 W. Riverside Avenue, Suite 1400  
Spokane, WA 99201  
Phone: (509) 324-9256  
Email: [chris@leehayes.com](mailto:chris@leehayes.com)

DEFENDANT LAMBERSON'S MOTION  
TO DISMISS PLAINTIFF'S FIRST AMENDED  
COMPLAINT, OR FOR LEAVE TO FILE SECOND  
AMENDED ANSWER, AFFIRMATIVE DEFENSES,  
AND COUNTERCLAIM- 8

LEE & HAYES, PLLC  
601 West Riverside Avenue, Suite 1400  
Spokane, Washington 99201  
Telephone: (509)324-9256 Fax: (509)323-8979